

## **DO THE CURRENT ELECTORATES OF THE CITY OF TIRANA PERCEIVE A CHANGE IN CORRUPT BEHAVIOR IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AFTER USING E-GOVERNMENT-TYPE APPLICATION PROCEDURES?**

**Anila Gjonaj**

University of Tirana

Faculty of Social Science

Department of Political Science

**ALBANIA**

**Aleksandër Kocani**

University of Tirana

Faculty of Social Science

Department of Political Science

**ALBANIA**

### **ABSTRACT**

When we talking about the phenomenon of electronical of public service provision procedures for citizens, it is a factual fact that a certain relationship is established between different social actors. In the present case, we would have a relationship between public administration employees and citizens seeking a service from the public administration. But here we have the opportunity where the server may not be physically but replaced by a machine.

In this paper is set up on a research question we will try to give an answer or affirm or reject it. The question or the problem is: Does the current electorate of the city of Tirana perceive a change in corrupt behavior in the public administration after using e-government application procedures? So in other words, do we have a change in the perception of corruption in public administration and post-implementation or implementing digital governances, government electronically, or electronic procedures in delivering services to citizens by the Albanian public administration? And the answer to the research question will not be based on a hypothesis but a basic assumption, to confirm it, or not to confirm it as a basic assumption which is "The current Tirana city electorate perceives that there is a change in corruptive behavior in the public administration after using the "e-government" application procedures.

The study is part of research-based that seeks to determine the level of e-government and how this has affected the perceived level of corruption in the Albanian public administration.

**Keywords:** problem, public administration, procedures, e-government

## **INTRODUCTION**

The idea of studying the perception by the electorate of the city of Tirana of possible changes in the corruption behavior of public administration as a result of the implementation of procedures for applying e-government type procedures in particular with regard to the provision of services by the Albanian public administration. Since direct investigation of the scale of influence of the e-government mechanism in relation to the phenomenon of corruption is a difficult task even for the specialized bodies to follow it and more difficult to measure, it was judged to ask the perception that the Albanian electorate has for this phenomenon if they know first and then their perception about the influence of e-government on changing the perception of corruption. For implications that cannot be measured by perception, but measurable data available from Albanian public administration institutions were readily available and a full analysis was made.

When we talking about the phenomenon of electronical of public service provision procedures for citizens, it is a factual fact that a certain relationship is established between different social actors. In the present case, we would have a relationship between public administration employees and citizens seeking a service from the public administration ("servants" and "clients") but in this case we have the opportunity or the case where the server may not be physically but substitute by a machine (computer).

The paper is raised on a research question we will try to give an answer, either affirm or reject it. The question or the problem is: Does the current electorate of the city of Tirana perceive a change in corrupt behavior in the public administration after using the "e-government" application procedures? So in other words do we have a change in the perception of public administration and corruption in it after the implementation or implementation of digital governance, electronical governance, or electronical of procedures in providing services to citizens from the Albanian public administration? And the answer to the research question will not be based on a hypothesis but a basic assumption, to confirm it, or not to confirm it as a basic assumption which is "The current Tirana city electorate perceives that there is a change in corruptive behavior in the public administration after using the "e-government" application procedures. The study is part of research-based that seeks to determine the level of e-government and how this has affected the perceived level of corruption in the Albanian public administration.

## **ANALYSIS OF DATA AND RESULTS**

Based on the research question, the basic assumption was drawn up as its supposed response. From the basic assumption, the relevant implications were deduced and the indicators were used to collect the information that enabled the empirical test to be carried out. In line with these indicators, the draft of the questionnaire was drawn up and the final questionnaire was drawn up, and the questionnaire collected the data that are analyzed below. Initially we are analyzing data related to empirical testing of the implications deduced from the basic assumption. So we have the picture as follows.

**Implication 1** "If the current constituency of the city of Tirana perceives that there is a change in corrupt behavior in the public administration after using e-government-type application procedures, then it is expected to find a reduction in citizens seeking services in offices of public administration ".

To measure this implication, the combination of results emerged from the crossroads of the question of the use of online services in the public administration with the question of whether this technique facilitated their taking. As a tool for analysis, Symmetric Measures tables were used and confirmation responses will be obtained from 2 elements that are Cramer's V and Approx. Sig.

Q.10: Do you think that the provision of online services by the Albanian state administration has made it easier for them to get them from citizens?

Q.9: If you used online service, was it: 1. Totally online (or, digitized)?

2. Or, partially online and partly in the old way (by going to the public administration offices)?

Symmetric Measures			
		Value	Approx. Sig.
Nominal by Nominal	Phi	.623	.000
	Cramer's V	.254	.000
N of Valid Cases		215	

From this table we can see that we have a companion force of .254, which is greater than the allowed lower limit of .20. Which means that for this indicator there is moderate or moderate strong statistical association between the two crossed variables. On the other hand, the indicator of the significance of the statistical association has a very high value of 0,000, which means that for this junction of the variables we have a significant statistical association. As a result between the two crossed variables there is significant statistical association, which means that we have a positive result of empirical testing of the implication 1.

Also, to derive exactly the results for the implication 1, consideration is given to the intersection of the other two variables, such as the facilitation of service delivery, which was considered above but already intersected with the perception that if it has brought about change the level of corruption?

Q.10: Do you think that the provision of online services by the Albanian state administration has made it easier for citizens to get them:

Q. 4: What can be said around you (family, relatives, friends, acquaintances, neighbors, etc.), can it be considered that "online services" in the public administration have brought:

- A very large reduction of corruption...

Symmetric Measures			
		Value	Approx. Sig.
Nominal by Nominal	Phi	.580	.000
	Cramer's V	.237	.000
N of Valid Cases		217	

From this table it is seen that we have a companion force of .237, which is greater than the allowed lower limit of .20. Which means that for this indicator there is a moderate statistical association between two crossed variables. On the other hand, the indicator of the significance of the statistical association has a very high value of 0,000, which means that for this junction of the variables we have a significant statistical association. As a result between the two crossed variables there is significant statistical association, which means that we have a positive result of empirical testing of the implication 1.

Through these two intersections we have been able to confirm the link existing between using online services and facilitating access to service by individuals in the public administration and we could confirm that there is a link between easing the service delivery and the perception of landing Of the level of corruption.

***Implication 1.1*** "If the current municipal electorate of Tirana perceives that there is a change in corrupt behavior in the public administration after using e-government-type application procedures, then it is expected that it will be established that there are no public administration offices More with citizens seeking services. "

Q.10: Do you think that the provision of online services by the Albanian state administration has made it easier for them to get them from citizens?

Q.13: Do you think that the introduction of services electronically (in whole or in part) in the state administration has reduced the ranks for the citizens?

<b>Symmetric Measures</b>			
		Value	Approx. Sig.
Nominal by Nominal	Phi	.640	.000
	Cramer's V	.286	.000
N of Valid Cases		217	

From this table it is seen that we have a companion force of .286, which is greater than the allowed lower limit of .20. Which means that for this indicator there is a moderate strong statistical association between the two crossed variables. On the other hand, the indicator of the significance of the statistical association has a very high value of 0,000, which means that for this junction of the variables we have a significant statistical association. As a result between the two crossed variables there is significant statistical association, which means that we have a positive result of the empirical testing of the implication 1.1. Also, it was not only the crossroads regarding the services in the Albanian electron administration and the decrease of the ranks in the receiving of services, but just below were taken the perception of corruption and the ranks in the taking of services in the Albanian public administration. So less rank, less corrupt.

Q 4: What is being said about you (family, relatives, friends, acquaintances, neighbors, etc.), can it be considered that "online services" in the public administration have brought:

- A huge reduction in corruption. . .

Q.13 Do you think that the introduction of electronic services (in whole or in part) in the state administration has reduced the ranks of citizens?

Symmetric Measures			
		Value	Approx. Sig.
Nominal by Nominal	Phi	.506	.003
	Cramer's V	.226	.003
N of Valid Cases		218	

From this table it is seen that we have a companion force of .226, which is greater than the allowed lower limit of .20. Which means that for this indicator there is a moderate statistical association between two crossed variables. On the other hand, the indicator of the significance of the statistical association has a very high value of 0.003, which means that for this junction of the variables we have an acceptable statistical association. As a result, between the two crossed variables there is significant statistical association, which means that we have a positive result of empirical testing of the implication 1.1

**Implication 1.2** *"If the current Tirana electorate perceives that there is a change in corrupt behavior in the public administration after using e-government-type application procedures, then it is expected to be found that there is an abbreviation of the receiving time Service in the public administration offices. "*

This implication is confirmed by the abovementioned intersections analyzed and placed in the implication 1, in facilitating the provision of services, as well as by the second junction in the downsizing, both bringing down the time that should be spent to receive the service, as well as from the data received from the administration for the following implications, will be further confirmed the reduction of time in obtaining services in the public administration.

**Implication 1.3** *"If the current constituency of the city of Tirana perceives that there is a change in corrupt behavior in the public administration after the use of e-government-type application procedures, then it is expected to avoid physical contact between public service providers ( public administration) and recipients of the service (people). "*

For this reason, the empirical test is positive and is confirmed by the intersection of variables that are considered in implication 1, ease of use of services, and the continuous increase in the use of fully and partially digitized public services. Also, a reinforcement of this implication is the data received from the public administration. The positive test of this implication best supports the data received from the ministry of innovation on increasing the number of individuals who receive service on the e-Albania government portal and do not go to the civil service offices. This number in 2013 was 49,809, in 2014 increased by 43,333 new users on this portal. Year 215 marks the highest increase with 76776 and in 2016 the number of new users increased by 71703. This shows a decrease in physical contact between citizens and employees of the Albanian public administration because individuals are increasingly receiving online service.

**Implication 1.4** *"If the current municipal electorate of Tirana perceives that there is a change in corrupt behavior in the public administration after the use of e-government-type application*

*procedures, then it is possible to ascertain the cases of services where the procedures are conducted electronically ( partially or completely). "*

For this implication the empirical test is positive and the confirmation comes from the intersection of the variables that are considered in the implication 1: the continuous increase in the use of fully and partly digitized public services. We also used data from the Albanian public administration to confirm this implication. The data show that the number of new electronic services has increased, where it is clear that during 2014 we have an increase of 105 new electronic services compared to 2013, in 2015 we have 129 electronic services increased number of electronic services compared in 2013 and in 2016 added 217 new services, increasing their total to 33 times compared to 2013 on a complete list of services unique e-government portal Albania.

In e-Albania's government portal at the end of 2016, the number of electronic services at level 1-2 was 583. Given that level 1 and 2 in e-government implies only informing the citizen or the business in the existence of a web-page of the public institution and the placement of informative information not the user in partially. Also, services at level 3 and 4 in the public administration, which are not only informative services but above all users, thus fully electronic have increased. Their number in 2013 was 14, in 2014 went 119, in 2015 this number increased to 248 and by 2016 the services are full 465.

Also, on the e-Albania's unique government portal, which is linked to the Government Gateway, in which 37 institutions are exchanged data in real time within 2016, this number has increased to 42.

***Implication 1.5 "If the current constituency of the city of Tirana perceives that there is a change in corrupt behavior in the public administration after using e-government-type application procedures, then it is possible to ascertain the shortening of bureaucratic procedures in these services."***

Q 4: What is being said about you (family, relatives, friends, acquaintances, neighbors, etc.), can it be considered that "online services" in the public administration have brought:

- A huge reduction in corruption. . .

Q 17: Do you think that the introduction of online services (in whole or in part) in the state administration has made it easier and clearer to seek and obtain services in the state administration?

<b>Symmetric Measures</b>			
		Value	Approx. Sig.
Nominal by Nominal	Phi	.522	.039
	Cramer's V	.213	.039
N of Valid Cases		218	

From this table it is seen that we have a companion force of .213, which is greater than the allowed lower limit of .20. Which means that for this indicator there is moderate or modest statistical association between the two crossed variables. On the other hand, the indicator of the meaning of the statistical association has the value of 0.039 significant statistical significance, which means that for this junction of the variables we have a significant statistical association.

As a result, between the two crossed variables there is significant statistical association, which means that we have a positive result of the empirical testing of the implication 1.5.

**Implication 1.6** *"If the current constituency of the city of Tirana perceives that there is a change in corrupt behavior in the public administration after the use of" e-government "application procedures, then it is possible to ascertain the cost reduction of these services."*

Q. 4: What is being said about you (family, relatives, friends, acquaintances, neighbors, etc.), can it be considered that "online services" in the public administration have brought:

- A huge reduction in corruption. . .

Q. 12: Do you think the introduction of online services (in whole or in part) has reduced the cost of citizens for receiving services in the state administration?

<b>Symmetric Measures</b>			
		Value	Approx. Sig.
Nominal by Nominal	Phi	.532	.025
	Cramer's V	.217	.025
N of Valid Cases		218	

From this table it is seen that we have a companion force of .217, which is greater than the allowed lower limit of .20. Which means that for this indicator there is moderate or modest statistical association between the two crossed variables. On the other hand, the indicator of the meaning of the statistical association has a very high value of 0.025, which means that for this junction of the variables we have a significant statistical association. As a result, between the two cross-linked variables there is significant statistical association, which means that we have a positive result of empirical testing of the implication 1.6

**Implication 2** *"If the current constituency of the city of Tirana perceives that there is a change in corrupt behavior in the public administration after the use of" e-government "application procedures, then it is possible to ascertain a perception of reducing the degree of corruption in public administration. "*

Only question 4 is enough to see the perception of individuals about corruption in the Albanian public administration. P. 4: What is said about you (family, relatives, friends, acquaintances, neighbors, etc.), can it be considered that "online services" in the public administration have brought: - a very large reduction of Corruption. . .

9: If you used online service, was he:

-Totally online (or, digitized)?

- Or, partially online and partly in the old way (by going to the public administration offices)?

<b>Symmetric Measures</b>			
		Value	Approx. Sig.
Nominal by Nominal	Phi	.444	.201
	Cramer's V	.181	.201
N of Valid Cases		217	

From this table we can see that we have a companion force of .181, which is smaller than the lower allowed limit of .20. Which means that for this indicator there is no significant statistical association between the two crossed variables. On the other hand, the indicator of the significance of the statistical association has an unacceptable statistical value of 0.201, which means that for this junction of the variables we do not have a significant statistical association. As a result, between the two crossed variables there is significant statistical association, which means that we have a negative result of empirical testing of the implication 2.

**Implication 2.1** *"If the current municipal electorate of Tirana perceives that there is a change in corrupt behavior in the public administration after the use of e-government-type application procedures, it is expected that the electorate's opinion will be found to reduce corruption in payment the fines. "*

Q 4: What is being said about you (family, relatives, friends, acquaintances, neighbors, etc.), can it be considered that "online services" in the public administration have brought:

- A huge reduction in corruption. . .

Q14: Do you think that the introduction of online services (in whole or in part) has led the state administration to ease the payment the fines:

Symmetric Measures			
		Value	Approx. Sig.
Nominal by Nominal	Phi	.417	.374
	Cramer's V	.170	.374
N of Valid Cases		219	

From this table we can see that we have a companion force of .170, which is smaller than the allowed lower limit of .20. Which means that for this indicator there is no significant statistical association between the two crossed variables. On the other hand, the indicator of the significance of the statistical association has an unacceptable value of 0.374, which means that for this the crossing of the variables we do not have a significant statistical association. As a result, between the two cross-linked variables there is no significant statistical association, which means that we have a negative result of the empirical testing of the implication 2.1.

**Implication 2.2** *"If the current constituency of the city of Tirana perceives that there is a change in corrupt behavior in the public administration after using e-government-type application procedures, it is expected that the electorate's opinions on reducing corruption in Paying taxes from businesses. "*

Q 4: What is being said about you (family, relatives, friends, acquaintances, neighbors, etc.), can it be considered that "online services" in the public administration have brought:

- A huge reduction in corruption. . .

Q. 16: According to you, did the introduction of online services (in whole or in part) bring to the state administration an easing tax on business taxes?



<b>Symmetric Measures</b>			
		Value	Approx. Sig.
Nominal by Nominal	Phi	.605	.043
	Cramer's V	.247	.043
N of Valid Cases		219	

From this table we can see that we have a companion force of .247, which is greater than the lower allowed limit of .20. Which means that for this indicator there is moderate or moderate strong statistical association between the two crossed variables. On the other hand, the indicator of the meaning of the statistical association has an acceptable value of 0.043, which means that for this junction of the variables we have a significant statistical association. As a result, between the two cross-linked variables there is significant statistical association, which means that we have a positive result of empirical testing of the implication 2.2

## CONCLUSIONS

From the examination of cross-tabulations that empirically tested the basic assumption (for the survey conducted in the city of Tirana), it turns out that 10 out of 11 combinations of them testify to significant statistical association. This means that it can be considered that we have a positive result of empirical testing of the implications deduced from the basic assumption. We have only the implication 2.1 which is not confirmed by the results obtained from the citizen's perception and implication 2.2 that doesn't have the strong significance.

Finally, it can be said that the empirical test is more likely to confirm the basic assumption of work, thus giving a positive answer to the research question "Does the current electorate of the city of Tirana perceive a change in corrupt behavior in the public administration after using the "e-government" application procedures? The empirical test in this case confirms that there is a different perception and this is for a reduction of corruption in the Albanian public administration after the implementation of e-government procedures, which gives us the right To propose to the scientific community to consider as acceptable the solution we gave to the research problem in the form of a basic assumption.

So it can be said that this study most likely shows that there is not only a changed perception about public administration and the level of corruption in it, but there is also an increase in the use of e-government procedures. These data tell us the reality of using e-government procedures and the results that it has brought.

## **REFERENCES**

Kocani, A. (2013) *Një Qasje Plotësuese Epistemologjike në Metodologjinë e Kërkimit të Shkencave Sociale*, Tiranë: Albanian University Press.

Popper, K.R. (1992) *The Logic of Scientific Discovery*, London and New York: Routledge 1992.

Bernstein, R .A., Dyer, J.A., (2014) *An introduction to Political Science Methods*, New Jersey: Prentice Hall Englewood Cliffs.

*United Nations e-government Survey 2014, e-government for the future we want*. Department of Economic and Social Affairs: United Nations, New York, 2014.

*Raport Vjetor Përmbledhës – 2016*. Agjencia kombëtare e Shoqërisë së Informacionit. Tiranë:  
<http://akshi.gov.al/images/raporti%20vjetor%202016.pdf>

*Specifikime Teknike “Sistemi i Ndërveprimit të Bazave të të Dhënave Shtetërore”*(2013), Agjencia kombëtare e shoqërisë së informacionit autoriteti rregullator koordinues i bazave të të dhënave shtetërore.

[https://akshi.gov.al/Standarde%20Teknike/specifikime\\_teknike\\_sistemi\\_i\\_nderveprimit\\_te\\_db.pdf](https://akshi.gov.al/Standarde%20Teknike/specifikime_teknike_sistemi_i_nderveprimit_te_db.pdf)